Cooperation and individuality among man-eating lions

Justin D. Yeakela,b,1, Bruce D. Pattersonb, Kena Fox-Dobbsc, Mercedes M. Okumurad, Thure E. Cerlingg, Jonathan W. Mooref, Paul L. Kochg, and Nathaniel J. Dominy,a,h,1

*Department of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Santa Cruz, 1156 High Street, Santa Cruz, CA 95064; bDepartment of Zoology, Field Museum of Natural History, 1400 South Lake Shore Drive, Chicago, IL 60605; cDepartment of Geography, University of Puget Sound, 1500 North Warner Street, CMB 1048, Tacoma, WA 98416-1048; dLeverhulme Centre for Human Evolutionary Studies, University of Cambridge, Fitzwilliam Street, Cambridge CB2 1QH, United Kingdom; eDepartment of Geology and Geophysics, University of Utah, 135 South 1460 E, Salt Lake City, UT 84112; fDepartment of Ecology and Evolutionary Biology, University of California, Santa Cruz, 100 Shaffer Road, Santa Cruz, CA 95060; and Departments of gEarth and Planetary Sciences and hAnthropology, University of California, Santa Cruz, 1156 High Street, Santa Cruz, CA 95064

Edited by Kristen Hawkes, University of Utah, Salt Lake City, UT, and approved September 25, 2009 (received for review May 13, 2009)

Cooperation is the cornerstone of lion social behavior. In a notorious case, a coalition of two adult male lions from Tsavo, southern Kenya, cooperatively killed dozens of railway workers in 1898. The “man-eaters of Tsavo” have since become the subject of numerous popular accounts, including three Hollywood films. Yet the full extent of the lions’ man-eating behavior is unknown; estimates range widely from 28 to 135 victims. Here we use stable isotope ratios to quantify increasing dietary specialization on novel prey during a time of food limitation. For one lion, the δ13C and δ15N values of bone collagen and hair keratin (which reflect dietary inputs over years and months, respectively) reveal isotopic changes that are consistent with a progressive dietary specialization on humans. These findings not only support the hypothesis that prey scarcity drives individual dietary specialization, but also demonstrate that sustained dietary individuality can exist within a cooperative framework. The intensity of human predation (up to 30% reliance during the final months of 1898) is also associated with severe craniodental infirmities, which may have further promoted the inclusion of unconventional prey under perturbed environmental conditions.

Individual dietary specialization can result from high intraspecific competition (1, 2). It has been reported in many animal populations (1, 3); however, its effects on the social behaviors of cooperative species are poorly understood. Among lions, cooperative behaviors are well known (4–7), yet the presence of laggards (8), cheaters (9), and specialized hunters (7) within social networks hints at highly complex, complementary individual behaviors. Recent work has shown that food limitation can drive individual dietary specialization within a population of carnivores (3, 10), including lions that prey on humans (11), but such idiosyncratic behaviors are rarely cooperative. Here we explore the environmental circumstances associated with a celebrated case of sustained man eating by a coalition of lions and use isotopic data to quantify individual dietary specialization through time.

The Tsavo region of Kenya witnessed profound environmental changes toward the end of the 19th century. Reduced elephant populations resulted in the expansion of woodlands and the reduction of grass-eating (grazing) herbivores (12). The severe Mkwaisenge drought of 1897–1900 (13), and the rinderpest viral epidemics of 1889 and 1898 (affecting wild and domestic bovids), combined to further reduce herbivore populations in Tsavo (12, 14). With the construction of the Uganda Railway in 1898, this reduction in carnivore prey species was attended by an increased human presence along the railway, both resident Taita agropastoralists (13) and some Indian laborers (12).

From March to December 1898, a coalition of two male lions (as inferred by paired track marks and frequent sightings) (15) killed 28 laborers and “scores of unfortunate African natives” during the construction of the railway through Tsavo (16). The death toll was later revised to 135 humans (15), although the accuracy of this value has been challenged (12). On December 9, Lieutenant Colonel J. H. Patterson D.S.O., a British officer and engineer, killed lion FMNH 23970 (Field Museum of Natural History) (Fig. 1A). The skull evinced craniodental pathologies, including malocclusion of the jaws and a fractured lower right canine (17) (Fig. 1B). On December 29, Patterson killed lion FMNH 23969 (Fig. 1C), the skull of which revealed a fractured upper left carnassial (17) (Fig. 1D), which is relatively common among lions (18). Given that the attacks on humans and livestock ceased after December 9 and December 29, respectively, and on the basis of the appearance of each lion (the skins were described as being uniquely scored by thorns) (15), it is almost certain that the lions Patterson killed were those responsible for the human depredations.

To investigate the relative importance of potential prey groups to each lion, we determined the stable carbon (13C/12C) and nitrogen (15N/14N) isotope ratios (reported in δ notation) of bone or tooth collagen and hair keratin. δ13C values (which distinguish plants that use C3 and C4 photosynthesis and are maintained in the tissues of consumers) and δ15N values (which increase with trophic level) are used to characterize niche space (19) and estimate the percent contributions from multiple prey items (20). Analysis of dietary input across different time windows over an animal’s lifetime is possible because different biological tissues are renewed at different rates. Bone collagen is regenerated slowly, whereas hair incorporates dietary information over a period of months (21). For the 7- to 8-year-old FMNH 23969 and 23970, bone collagen is a good estimate of dietary input over their lifespan (multiyear average). Keratin from tail-tuft hairs (averaging 2.6 ± 0.5 cm from base to tip) offers a complementary dietary window over an estimated 3-month period before death (final-months average). Finally, for comparative purposes, we sampled a population of modern Tsavo lions from a region between Tsavo West and Tsavo East National Parks (hereafter TWNP and TENP, respectively). We sampled skin and muscle tissue, which records a dietary input of several weeks.

Results

Characterization of Prey Sources. The isotopic ratios of potential prey were obtained from the tooth collagen of Tsavo herbivores (collected by T. E. Cerling between 1999 and 2000, which include samples from a 1970 die-off) and the bone collagen of Taita

Author contributions: J.D.Y., B.D.P., P.L.K., and N.J.D. designed research; J.D.Y., B.D.P., and N.J.D. performed research; K.F.-D., M.M.O., and T.E.C. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; J.D.Y., B.D.P., K.F.-D., J.W.M., P.L.K., and N.J.D. analyzed data; and J.D.Y., B.D.P., P.L.K., and N.J.D. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

1To whom correspondence may be addressed. E-mail: jyeakel@pmc.ucsc.edu or njdominy@ucsc.edu.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/cgi/content/full/0905309106/DCSupplemental.

Author contributions: J.D.Y., B.D.P., P.L.K., and N.J.D. designed research; J.D.Y., B.D.P., and N.J.D. performed research; K.F.-D., M.M.O., and T.E.C. contributed new reagents/analytic tools; J.D.Y., B.D.P., K.F.-D., J.W.M., P.L.K., and N.J.D. analyzed data; and J.D.Y., B.D.P., P.L.K., and N.J.D. wrote the paper.

The authors declare no conflict of interest.

This article is a PNAS Direct Submission.

1To whom correspondence may be addressed. E-mail: jyeakel@pmc.ucsc.edu or njdominy@ucsc.edu.

This article contains supporting information online at www.pnas.org/cgi/content/full/0905309106/DCSupplemental.
skulls are exhumed, severed, and enshrined in ancestral caves or rock shelters by L. S. B. Leakey (22, 35). Such a shrine results from the unusual funerary left carnassial with a double pulp exposure (17) (FMNH photo archives 29, 1898 (16). (Fig. 24) (all values for fully corrected data). The Taita population (n = 12) has intermediate δ13C values (−13.0 ± 1.3‰) and low δ15N values (11.4 ± 0.9‰) (Fig. 24) and is comparable to other agropastoral populations in Kenya (23, 24). Such isotope values are consistent with a mixed diet of corn and mbaazi (25, 26). Corn is a protein-poor, carbohydrate-rich, C4 food, whereas mbaazi is a proteinaceous pea soup made from Cajanus spp. and Vigna spp. (N-fixing C3 legumes with low δ15N values). Accordingly, mbaazi was likely the dominant source of protein (and therefore nitrogen) in Taita diets. Although protein is normally the primary predictor of collagen δ13C values, carbohydrate carbon can have an increasing influence on collagen when total dietary protein is low (see figure 3 in ref. 27); hence, our Taita δ13C values reflect a mix of C3 (mbaazi) and C4 (corn) foods.

Calculation of Prey Contribution to Diet. To quantify the contribution of each potential prey source to the diets of each lion, we used a Bayesian isotope mixing model (mixSIR v. 1.0.4) (20). Because there are several estimations involved in correcting tissue-specific and trophic fractionations, mixSIR includes these potential sources of error into the final posterior distributions of each source in a mix. We used noninformative priors to limit treatment of the data to that of our isotopic results.

Modern Tsavo lions evinced isotope values consistent with a diet composed entirely of grazers from TWNP (δ13C = −8.9‰ ± 0.7‰; δ15N = 13.0‰ ± 0.3‰; n = 5), suggesting that they consumed prey from western Tsavo for a period of weeks before sample collection. Their reliance on grazers (84%; this and hereafter are median values of the posterior distribution from mixSIR, indicating the most probable contribution of prey) is similar to previous isotopic data for East African lions (28).

The putative man-eaters showed distinct isotope values. Throughout much of its life, FMNH 23969 had a diet similar to modern Tsavo lions and was heavily reliant on TWNP grazers (multiyear average: δ13C = −10.1‰; δ15N = 13.6‰; median contribution = 41%). Toward the end of its life, the lion continued to rely on grazing animals, although subsisted on herbivores from TWNP and TENP to similar extents (final-months average: δ13C = −11.1‰; δ15N = 14.6‰; median contributions = 30% TWNP grazers, 37% TENP grazers). By contrast, lion FMNH 23970 progressed from a diet focused on grazers (multiyear average: δ13C = −12.1‰; δ15N = 14.3‰; median contributions = 25% TWNP grazers, 30% TENP grazers) to one emphasizing browsers, browser/mixed-feeders, and humans toward the end of 1898 (final-months average: δ13C = −13.4‰; δ15N = 13.0‰; median contributions = 23% TWNP browsers, 30% Taita agropastoralists). This latter result (Fig. 2 A and B and Table S1) verifies historical accounts that assigned the lion’s share of human deaths to FMNH 23970 (14, 16). This finding also agrees well with the infirmity hypothesis (18, 29, 30), which holds that physically impaired pantherids are more likely to resort to human depredation.

Discussion

The results from our model also enable us to estimate the extent of the lions’ man-eating behavior. Our estimate is based on the following assumptions: (i) lions require an average of approximately 6 kg of food/day−1 (31); (ii) 2.6 ± 0.5 cm of hair keratin reflects dietary input during the final 3 months of life (21); (iii) approximately 20 kg of consumable tissue per person (25% of an 80-kg human) was consumed after each attack, which is consis-

agropastoralists (skulls collected by L. S. B. Leakey during the East African Archaeological Expedition of 1929; Fig. 1 E) (22). Because the attacks occurred central to and at the boundary of TWNP and TENP, we analyzed browsers (Giraffa camelopardalis, Taurotragus oryx, Tragelaphus imberbis), browser/mixed-feeders (Aepyceros melampus), and grazers (Equus burchelli, Kobus ellipsiprymnus, Oryx beisa, Syncerus caffer) from both regions. After adjusting for (i) tissue-specific isotopic fractionations among lion populations and potential prey (corrected to bone collagen values), (ii) trophic differences between predator and prey tissues (corrected by adding +1‰ and +3.5‰ to prey δ13C and δ15N values, respectively), and (iii) the global decrease in the δ13C value of atmospheric CO2 [see Dataset S1], our results reveal low δ13C values for browsers and high δ13C values for grazers (reflecting isotopic differences between C3 and C4 photosynthetic pathways), and a significant difference between the δ15N values of herbivores in TWNP and TENP (Fig. S1), suggesting that the δ15N values of herbivores vary with declining rainfall from west to east (14).

To account for differences in herbivore diets and regional differences in rainfall, we binned the browsers and grazers of TWNP and TENP separately; herbivores from unknown local-

Fig. 1. The man-eaters of Tsavo and a Taita ancestral shrine. (A) Lieutenant Colonel J. H. Patterson and lion FMNH 23970 shot December 9, 1898 (16) (FMNH photo archives no. 293658, Field Museum of Natural History). (B) Articulated jaws of FMNH 23970 revealing a fractured lower right canine (and subsequent root-tip abscess), missing lower incisors, supererupted upper right incisors, and rotation and malocclusion of the upper right canine. Cranial asymmetry of 23970 occurred after injury and before death (14) (FMNH photo archives no. 294320.11c, Field Museum). (C) Lion FMNH 23969 shot December 29, 1898 (16). (D) Articulated jaws of FMNH 23969, revealing a fractured upper left carnassial with a double pulp exposure (17) (FMNH photo archives 294321.6c, Field Museum). (E) A Taita ancestral shrine photographed in 1929 by L. S. B. Leakey (22, 35). Such a shrine results from the unusual funerary practices of the Taita; after approximately 1 year of burial in a seated position, skulls are exhumed, severed, and enshrined in ancestral caves or rock shelters (23, 39).
tent with behavioral observations (4). Accordingly, lion FMNH 23969 likely consumed approximately 3.5 humans toward the end of 1898 (median contribution = 13% reliance on the Taita). Lion FMNH 23970 likely consumed approximately 8.1 humans during the same period (median contribution = 30% reliance on the Taita). If these values are interpolated across the 9 months of recorded man-eating behavior, our estimate increases to 10.5 and 24.2 humans consumed by FMNH 23969 and 23970, respectively. The sum of these figures is 34.7, with a possible range of 4–72 humans consumed (from the 5–95% Bayesian confidence intervals of percentage of Taita contribution to diet; Table S1). Our median estimate is larger than the Uganda Railway’s documented value of 28 humans killed (16), and much less than Patterson’s estimate of 135 humans killed (15).

Relatively small coalitions of lions are suboptimal (5, 6), but common in shrubby habitats (7). For instance, prides with a single male and 4–6 females occur regularly in Tsavo today (32); however, Tsavo is more open than it was in the 1890s (12). Accordingly, the dyad of FMNH 23969 and 23970 is not itself peculiar, but the tendency to differentially specialize on rare prey is. In this case, the pair frequently exposed itself to high-risk, low-yield situations to procure food whereas only one lion (FMNH 23970) obtained significant nutritional input from humans. Although lions share prey with pride mates, respect for ownership during feeding (33) may preclude individuals in a dyad from consuming equal amounts, particularly when prey is small. Eyewitness reports of the attacks suggest that one lion was initially responsible for the bulk of the depredations while the other waited in the bush; later attacks involved both lions (15).

Such behavior supports the possibility that dietary differences were initially related to prey ownership. To our knowledge, no other study has yet explored the significance of maintaining dietary individuality throughout the lifetime of one or more carnivores. We do not suggest that our analysis of two individuals paints a complete picture of lion foraging behavior; however, the temporal windows obtained from the isotopic analysis of different tissues reveals a sustained level of individuality—relative to each other and to modern populations—that becomes increasingly pronounced toward the end of 1898. Such dietary differences could have accrued during separate life histories, but it is tempting to speculate that FMNH 23969 and 23970 were littermates and lifelong partners. Regardless of their relatedness, our hair keratin results demonstrate that during the 9 months of observed cooperation (15), they maintained individually specialized diets. That these progressively divergent diets likely occurred in response to a series of recurring environmental and anthropogenic stressors that limited grazer abundance is concordant with the hypothesis that prey scarcity promotes individual dietary specialization (1–3, 10).

Dietary specialization within cooperative groups may be common in lion populations, as cooperative benefits transcend food acquisition (5). Because the Tsavo dyad maintained divergent diets throughout their lives, it can be inferred that they were deriving cooperative benefits apart from shared food. These benefits may have included confusing or disrupting prey during coordinated attacks or territorial defense from other lion groups. A dietary specialization on humans or human ancestors may be a long standing fallback strategy among lions (34); however, the risks associated with human depredation often outweigh the nutritional benefits. Severe environmental disturbances that impact traditional lion prey appear to mitigate these risks to some extent (11). The overall dietary differences reported here highlight the behavioral plasticity of male lions and the complex interplay of costs and benefits in regulating group behavior among social carnivores.

**Methods**

We sampled skin and muscle tissue from 5 modern Tsavo lions and bone and hair from FMNH 23969 and 23970 at the Field Museum of Natural History. We obtained bone samples from 12 Taita accessioned in the Duckworth Laboratorio (cave E, late 1800s) (35), and 25 Tsavo herbivores that died between 1970 and 2000. All bone samples, modern and historical, were treated with 0.5 M HCl for 3 days to remove inorganic carbonates. Samples were then sonicated in petroleum ether to separate contaminating lipids. Hair and skin/muscle samples were homogenized and treated with petroleum ether similarly.
followed by a methanol rinse. We analyzed samples with a Finnigan Delta Plus Continuous Flow mass spectrometer in the Departments of Earth and Planetary Sciences and Ocean Sciences, University of California-Santa Cruz. Isotopic ratios are expressed as δ values: δ = 1000[(Rsample/Rstandard) − 1] where R = either 13C/12C or 15N/14N; reference standards are Vienna PeeDee-belemnite for carbon and atmospheric N2 for nitrogen. We used tissue-specific fractionations to adjust samples to collagen-comparable values. A +2.2‰ 13C-enrichment was applied to skin/tissue and a +0.7‰ 13C-enrichment was applied to hair (36, 37). Changes in nitrogen between tissue types were negligible. A +1‰ 15N and a +3.5‰ 15N-enrichment was applied to prey sources to correct for trophic level differences (37). Finally, to account for the global decrease of 13C in atmospheric CO2 over the last 150 years, we applied a ~1.1‰ adjustment to the FMNH lions and Taita remains, and a ~0.6 and ~0.1‰ 13C adjustment to the 1971 and 1999–2000 fauna, respectively (38) (see Dataset S1). To account for possible error in all adjustments, we incorporated fractionation uncertainty into mixSIR (v.1.0.4) (20) for calculating the contribution of each dietary source; δ13C: 0.5‰, δ15N: 0.7‰. We used uninformative priors and 1 × 106 iterations.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS. We thank A. K. Behrensmeyer, E. E. Butler, C. E. Chow, C. T. Dimaront, J. A. Estes, L. Gehegan, P. Hluzova, J. B. Hopkins, S. D. Newsome, J. D. Phelps, J. W. Ridges, W. Stanley, R. H. Tuttle, E. R. Vogel, P. V. Wheatley, and Level C. C. Lambers for help and constructive comments and discussions. We thank the Duckworth Laboratory, the Field Museum of Natural History, and the Smithsonian National Museum of Natural History for access to unpublished field reports. Modern samples were imported under CITES import no. US-012 (PRT 701716). This study was approved by the Chancellor's Animal Research Committee of University of California (UC)-Santa Cruz (no. Domin0806) and approved as exempt by the Institutional Review Board of UC-Santa Cruz (no. HS0801187). This study was funded by the Earthwatch Institute, the David and Lucile Packard Foundation, and a grant from the UC-Santa Cruz Committee on Research.


15. Patterson JH (1925) The Man-Eating Lions of Tsavo (Field Museum of Natural History, Chicago).


